

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
CASE SUMMARY

3052 STATE ST

MST2010-00016

COMM ALTERATION

Page: 1

Project Description:

Proposal for an exterior facade remodel to include the demolition of a 1,288 square foot detached warehouse, demolition of 1,758 square feet of an existing 10,757 square foot building, to result in one 8,999 square foot commercial building with a 3,046 credit of Measure E square footage. The proposal includes site alterations to include 12 new parking spaces for a total of 34 on-site parking spaces, and revised parking lot and site landscaping to include the removal of two existing trees, the addition of nine new trees, and new site lighting. The proposal will abate the violations of ENF2009-00505.

Activities:

7/27/2010 *CC-ABR Appeal Filed*

7/12/2010 *ABR-FYI/Research*

Mailing labels for ABR appeal to CC prepared by Tony Boughman.

5/17/2010 *ABR-Final Review Hearing*

(Final Approval is requested. Preliminary Approval was granted on 4/5/2010.)

(5:30)

Present: Eric Marquart, Agent for Beverages & More, Inc.; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects; and Roger Deutschman, for Mike Lombardi Landscape Architects.

Public comment opened at 5:38 p.m.

A letter of concern from the neighborhood was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 5:39 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Gilliland/Zink absent).

Activities:

5/17/2010 ***ABR-Final Approval - Project***

5/10/2010 ***ABR-Prelim Approval - Details***

5/10/2010 ***ABR-Consent (Referred by FB)***

(Preliminary Approval of landscaping is requested. Preliminary Approval of architecture was granted on 4/5/2010.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Preliminary Approval of landscaping with conditions:

- 1) Substitute Strelitzia (bird of paradise) with pittosporum tobira variegata.*
- 2) Add 1-gallon Phormium Tom Thumb plantings.*

5/4/2010 ***ABR-Correspondence/Contact***

Ok to sub it for Building permit plan check per P. Casey. No permit issuance until final ABR approvals.

5/3/2010 ***ABR-Final Review Hearing***

(Project requires compliance with the Upper State Street Design Guidelines. Preliminary Approval was granted 4/5/2010. Final Approval is requested.)

(4:31)

Present: Eric Marquart, Agent for Beverages & More, Inc.; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects; and Tom Boranick, Project Manager of Terra Nova Industries; and Roger Deutschman, for Mike Lombardi Landscape Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The following public comment spoke with concerns regarding the proposed project:

- 1) Camille Scott (submitted alleyway photo), expressed concerns regarding the use of the alley and increased deliveries.*
- 2) John Reynolds, concerns regarding deliveries, alley use, and safe fire department access.*

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Activities:

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a different color instead of the proposed "peach" wainscoting and provide color samples.*
- 2) Change the green window trim to a bronze color to match the existing store front windows that are to remain.*
- 3) Provide a stain for the wood lintel detail, and provide a color for the wood roof overhang.*
- 4) Indicate on the plans where the truncated domes of contrasting color will be located.*
- 5) Study removing two pole-mounted lighting fixtures adjacent to the building and replace with one wall-mounted light fixture.*
- 6) Study the block wall cart storage; the Board suggests the applicant return with an open air solution.*
- 7) Study removing the proposed trellises along the building (including those to the rear and along the walkway) and replace with an organic clinging vine where vines would be necessary.*
- 8) Study the front planter, at ground level directly behind the existing sidewalk, making it larger in size.*
- 9) On Sheet A5.1, show the opaque window material not to exceed the underside of the first mullion.*
- 10) Indicate the height of signage on the south and east elevations to be of the same height.*
- 11) Modify the existing awning detail to remove the horizontal frame.*
- 12) Study the height of the wainscoting for the rear portion of the building, and consider lowering to the height of the proposed doors.*

Action: Zink/Sherry, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Gilliland/Gross absent).

4/19/2010***ABR-Final Review Hearing***

(Preliminary Approval granted 4/5/2010. Final Approval is requested.)

(7:24)

Present: Eric Marquart, of Terra Nova Industries; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects; Roger Deutschman, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:39 p.m.

Ms. Mary Chang spoke of her concerns regarding loading/unloading zones as defined, hours of operation, and land-use and traffic noise issues.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 7:41 p.m.

Mr. Limón clarified the analysis of consistency with the Upper State Street Design Guidelines and requested the Board's comments regarding specific topic areas, including the entrance location, front façade improvements, bicycle parking, landscaping and view preservation (prevent obstruction of mountain views), luminaire and lighting fixture issues, and shopping cart and trash enclosure location issues.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide location and heights of all mechanical equipment, and provide appropriate screening per the Upper State Street Design Guidelines.*

Activities:

- 2) Provide a high quality pedestrian experience for the State Street entrance per the Upper State Street Design Guidelines.
- 3) Provide locations and details of all pedestrian and other lighting locations, and remove the existing gooseneck fixture lighting on the front façade.
- 4) Study lowering the parapet height at the rear of the warehouse area.
- 5) Suggest a different material for the trash enclosure doors to match Spanish architecture.
- 6) Provide a less contrasting color for the wainscot and the awning.
- 7) Return with more traditional awning structure design with open sides and wrought iron.
- 8) Provide a more suitable location for the proposed bicycle parking.
- 9) Indicate on the plans the specific locations of opaque and clear window glass with reference to the interior display heights near the windows.
- 10) The proposed 7:00 a.m. deliver time is to be changed to a more appropriate 8:00 a.m. delivery time.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Create a new planting area along the front south-facing façade and indicate planting species type.
 - 2) Landscaping to be reviewed by the Board's Landscape Architect to study an appropriate replacement for the queen palm tree taking into consideration the preservation of view per the Upper State Street Design Guidelines, and providing as much privacy as possible to the neighboring property to the north.
- Action: Sherry/Zink, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Rivera opposed, Aurell/Gross/Gilliland absent).

4/12/2010**ABR-Resubmittal Received**

3 sets rec'd for FB review.

4/12/2010**ABR-Consent (Referred by FB)**

(Preliminary Approval of architecture was granted 4/5/2010. Preliminary Approval of landscaping is requested.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued one week to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Substitute the proposed koelreuteria trees for a more appropriate parking lot tree.
- 2) Consider the use of double and/or triple king palms in the landscape planters along State Street, instead of the jacaranda.
- 3) Replace the existing landscaping at the planter at the southeast entrance at State Street to compliment the proposed landscaping in the central planter (southwest) at State Street.
- 4) Revise, to simplify, the landscape planters at State Street to screen parking year round.
- 5) Study extending the planter at the southeast State Street entrance to allow for adequate planting to provide parking screening.
- 6) Indicate the ground cover landscaping in all existing and proposed planters.

4/7/2010**ABR-FYI/Research**

Preliminary approval motion on 4/5/10 granted preliminary approval of architecture. Referred to Consent review (4/12/10) for preliminary review of landscaping only. The project will be continued to the full board for final approval of the project (both arch & landscaping).

Activities:**4/5/2010*****ABR-Concept Review (Continued)***

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(5:00)

Present: Eric Marquart and Tom Beranek, of Terra Nova Industries; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects; Roger Deutschman, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m.

The following public comment spoke in opposition to the proposed project with mostly concerns regarding traffic and safety in the rear alley:

- 1) Erik Scott.*
- 2) Camille Scott.*
- 3) John Reynolds.*

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury and were acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 5:13 p.m.

Staff reminded the Board about the aesthetic focus for the proposed project, and that no other review board or commission will be reviewing the project.

Staff read a Transportation Division memo clarifying transportation requirements for the proposed pedestrian path of travel, minimum bicycle parking requirements, parking and landscaping.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a more appropriate color for the exterior of the building, preferably a lighter solid color instead of the proposed faux finish.*
- 2) Preliminary Approval of the proposed project is contingent upon confirmation of adequate sidewalk width and turn around space; including ADA requirements per Building and Safety staff recommendations.*
- 3) Provide appropriate awning color and details.*
- 4) Provide trash enclosure details.*
- 5) Return with more appropriate light fixture(s) to match the existing architecture.*
- 6) Confirm and indicate the height of the wainscot on all elevations; consider a taller wainscot.*
- 7) Return with a proposal for restricted delivery time frame for review by the Board, with input from Transportation Division staff, to mitigate neighborhood noise concerns.*
- 8) Show the existing window to remain on the south elevation (facing State Street).*
- 9) Additional landscaping review deferred to consent for review by the landscape architect.*
- 10) Study an appropriate location for the required bicycle parking spaces.*
- 11) Provide accurate color renderings*

Action: Sherry/Zink, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Mosel/Rivera opposed, Gilliland/Gross absent).

Activities:

4/5/2010 ***ABR-Prelim Approval - Project***

4/1/2010 ***ABR-Resubmittal Received***

Plan substitution with response to transportation comments received at Counter.

3/16/2010 ***ABR-Resubmittal Received***

3/8/2010 ***ABR-Concept Review (New)***

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:40)

Present: Eric Marquart and Tom Beranek, of Terra Nova Industries; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects;; Roger Deutschman, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:56 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Jerry Vigil, in opposition.*
- 2) Katie Turner, in opposition.*

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Email correspondences received from

- 1) Natalia Bliss, in support.*
- 2) Nick Koonce, in support.*

Public comment closed at 8:00 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a revised landscape plan to accurately indicate existing material to remain, existing material to be removed, and proposed landscaping.*
- 2) Return with any proposal for additional parking lot lighting, including fixture cut sheets, and photometrics.*
- 3) Study incorporating a pedestrian presence and entry from State Street.*
- 4) Study the parking configuration to be in compliance with City requirements for the number of tree wells, and study additional opportunities to introduce or retain additional landscaping materials.*

Activities:

5) *Study the configuration of the molding and tile details on the rear of the building to be consistent with the architecture.*

6) *Study methods to screen the open trash enclosure from public view.*

7) *Provide a color and materials board for any proposed changes.*

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross absent).

2/22/2010

ABR-Resubmittal Received

Resubmittal received to address preliminary plan check comments.